

Item Number: 12
Application No: 18/00314/LBC
Parish: Westow Parish Council
Appn. Type: Listed Building Consent
Applicant: Mr Philip Dibbs
Proposal: Demolition of existing boundary wall, fence and access gates including gate posts and erection of replacement stone walling, posts and painted timber pedestrian and vehicular gates (revised details to refusal 17/01266/LBC dated 14.12.2017)
Location: North Wing Firby Hall Village Streets Firby Malton YO60 7LH
Registration Date: 23 April 2018
8/13 Wk Expiry Date: 18 June 2018
Overall Expiry Date: 23 May 2018
Case Officer: Emma Woodland **Ext:** 324

CONSULTATIONS:

Parish Council	Concerns
Public Rights Of Way	Recommend Informative

Neighbour responses:

SITE:

Firby hall is a Grade II listed building located on a minor no through road set back from the road down a drive. The property is a substantial stone building now subdivided into flats. The development site (north wing) is located in the former service wing of the Hall.

PROPOSAL:

The application is a revised scheme following a previous refusal to erect a stone wall, timber fence and access gate to the front of North Wing.

POLICY:

Local Plan Strategy - Policy SP12 Heritage
National Planning Policy Framework

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY:

17/01266/LBC-Demolition of existing boundary wall, fence and access gates including gate posts and erection of replacement stone walling, posts and painted timber pedestrian and vehicular gates.-
Refused

17/01437/HOUSE-Demolition of existing boundary wall, fence and access gates including gate posts and erection of replacement stone walling, posts and painted timber pedestrian and vehicular gates.-
Refused

APPRAISAL:

Firby Hall is a Grade II listed building dating from the late 18th -early 19th century with later additions and alterations. As a Grade II listed building, the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas act) 1990 states that special regard should be given to the preservation of the listed building.

The hall is a substantial house constructed from stone with a Westmorland slate roof. It is now subdivided into flats. It has a substantial 5 bay main range with former service accommodation to the north. The house displays a flat, predominantly unornamented principle facade excepting the strong architectural feature of an early 20th century porch with steps and a shell hood which projects beyond the front of the listed building. This porch contributes to the architecture of the listed building.

The main consideration with this application are:

- Whether the proposal preserves the special interest of the listed building.

The location of the proposal is at the north wing of Firby Hall. This part of Firby Hall can be characterised as the former service accommodation to the hall which has recently undergone renovation and extension. It is considered that the renovation and extension respects the character of the listed building and maintains the clear legible hierarchy between the formal higher status principle elements and the former service accommodation. At present the north wing is a more modest recessive element of the building when seen as a whole and especially when seen from the front facade.

This proposal follows a refused Householder and Listed Building application in 2017. The works detailed in the former application had already commenced and have since ceased on site. The proposals were previously refused as it was considered that they did not preserve the special interest of the listed building. It was considered that the proposal would present a visual distraction that would compete with the prominence of the projecting shell porch which was identified as a feature which contributed to the special interest of the listed building. Whilst the design of the proposal remains the same, the position of the 'springing point' of the wall has been revised. A Heritage Statement undertaken by a qualified heritage professional accompanying this application finds that the proposal will not result in any harm to the listed building for the following reasons:

No historic fabric will be lost or altered

The proposals are fully reversible

The proposed stone wall will attach to the 20th century rendered extension

It will maintain the prominence of the shell porch and steps

The design details harmonise with the recently approved scheme

The design has been amended to re-locate the 'springing point' of the wall further away from the shell porch closer to the north of the site towards the 20th century rendered extension. This moves the wall c. 3.20 metres further away from the principal historic elevation of the listed building. The proposed stone boundary wall is c. 1.30 metres high and projects c. 3.5 metres out from the front façade of the listed building. It has a length of c. 2.5 metres (reduced from c.5.6 metres) and then presents a timber pedestrian gate with a set of timber vehicle gates beyond that finished by a masonry gate pier. The vestigial remains of a small section of mid-20th century stone wall which formed porch steps is annotated on the drawings as 'to be removed'. It is apparent however from my site visit that this has already taken place, which is considered to be acceptable. The proposed plans detail an 'existing' timber gate and fence which was positioned c. 3.5 metres further north of this application. These projected c. 3.8 metres from the face of the listed building. It was also apparent from my site visit that these have been removed which is also considered to be acceptable.

It is considered that this application addresses a previous Officer objection regarding the visually distracting element of the wall. The wall is moved c. 3.3 metres further from the principal elevation and is now located at a more natural point of the junction between 2 different architectural elements of the building. In addition, placing the stone wall in the foreground of the later rendered elevation will help to visually knit the rendered elevation and soften its effect. It is considered that the removal of the existing walling of the former porch steps is an enhancement.

Material planning concerns have been expressed by the Parish Council expressing the views that the proposed works would be aesthetically detrimental to its appearance.

It is considered that the submitted Heritage Statement draws a conclusion that is also supported by Officers. It is considered that this proposal overcomes previous Officer concern regarding the visual distraction which would result from the development. The position of the wall further away from the principal façade of the listed building (now located at a natural junction between 2 differing elements of the building) is considered to mitigate previous concerns. In addition, the removal of the former porch steps walling is considered to be an enhancement. The use of stone in the foreground of the rendered section is considered to visually soften this change of materials and it helps to 'knit in' the rendered section. The proposal therefore is considered to preserve the special interest of the listed building. The application has been carefully considered by Officers and is considered to comply with Policy SP12 and the NPPF.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval

1 The development hereby permitted shall be begun on or before .

Reason: To ensure compliance with Section 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plan(s): 1193_AR50_02_A.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

3 Prior to the commencement of the development hereby permitted, the developer shall construct on site for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority, a one metre square free standing panel of the external walling to be used in the construction of building. The panel so constructed shall be retained only until the development has been completed.

Reason: To preserve the listed building.